

WOULD A SALARY SYSTEM FOR LAW ENFORCEMENT  
OFFICERS BE AN EFFECTIVE FORM OF COMPENSATION AND  
CHANGE THE PROFESSIONAL PARADIGM IN THE YEAR 2008?

Project

California Commission on  
Peace Officers Standards and Training

by

Commander Richard P. Cinfio  
San Carlos Police department

Command College Class XXVII

Sacramento, California

October 1999

## Table of Contents

---

<b>Chapter I</b>	<b>The Need for Taking the Final Step to Professionalism</b>	<b>3</b>
	➤ Introduction	
	➤ A Look Back	
	➤ Law Enforcement as a Profession	
	➤ The Responsibility of Management	
<b>Chapter II</b>	<b>Forecasting the Future</b>	<b>14</b>
	➤ The Nominal Group Technique	
	➤ Trends	
	➤ Events	
	➤ Best Case Scenario	
	➤ Middle-of-the-Road Scenario	
	➤ Worst Case Scenario	
<b>Chapter III</b>	<b>Strategic Plan – The Professional Vision</b>	<b>28</b>
	➤ The Professional Vision	
	➤ Situational Analysis – The STEEP Model	
	➤ Analysis of the Organizational Culture – WOTS-UP	
	➤ Identification of Stakeholders and Analysis	
	➤ Stakeholder Analysis	
	➤ Development of Alternative Strategies	
<b>Chapter IV</b>	<b>The Effects of Salary Implementation</b>	<b>37</b>
	➤ The Model Organization	
	• The City	
	• The Police department	
	• Fiscal Analysis	
	• Post Transition Issues and Potential Resolutions	
	• Post Transition Benefits	
<b>Chapter V</b>	<b>A Comparison Model – Worthington Industries</b>	<b>42</b>
	➤ The Company	
	➤ Company Philosophy	
	➤ Meeting with Worthington Staff	
<b>Chapter VI</b>	<b>Recommendations and Conclusion</b>	<b>51</b>
	<b>Appendices</b>	<b>52</b>
	➤ Complete List of Trends	
	➤ Complete List of Events	
	<b>Endnotes</b>	<b>56</b>
	<b>Bibliography</b>	<b>57</b>

## **Chapter I**

### **The Need for Taking the Final Step towards Professionalism**

#### **Introduction**

Walt Disney was a rare individual because he could dream of a distant future, pluck an idea from that dream and make it a reality. In a replica of Walt Disney's office at Disneyland hangs a framed saying, which reads: "Remember! It all started with a mouse!"<sup>1</sup> A very simple thought that speaks volumes about Disney's accomplishments and serves as a reminder that the simplest idea can be used to transform an entire industry into something totally different than its current existence.

The premise of what is proposed in this project is just as simple and could also have a larger than intended result. Is it possible to be paid like a salaried professional and, thus, develop a change in the law enforcement officer's professional paradigm? The following examines a potential future state for law enforcement and the affects on the profession if a salary and paradigm shift were to become a reality become reality.

#### **A Look Back**

In his book *Six Gold Stars*, author Dexter H. Mast describes his career as an Oakland, California Police Officer.<sup>2</sup> Like the title implies, Mast spent 30 years as an officer, from 1939 to 1969, quite a span considering the social and political changes the City of Oakland, the State of California and the United States experienced during this time. Imagine mast starting his career between the tail-end of the Great Depression and pre World War II and ending his career at the conclusion of the most tumultuous decade of civil unrest this country has ever experienced since the Civil War.

What might have been the definition of a professional police officer when Mast started in 1939? Examination of the Author's Note in Mast's book provides some insight:

The language used and the prejudices expressed in this account are those of the forties and fifties and have not been modified to reflect our more enlightened ways today. Prejudices have always been a way for the ignorant to explain their failure in life.

The methods used by an Oakland police patrolman fifty years ago would not be acceptable today. We have set them down here only for what they are, a slice of personal history.

Still, I can't help but notice that today's streets are not as safe as they were, and the courts and police can't keep up with all the crime that is committed now. Qualified police officers are hard to find even though their beginning salary compares favorably with the incomes of workers in the world's oldest profession.

It is interesting that Officer Mast selects language, prejudice, methods and acceptable (behavior) as areas that require further explanation and justification because of what they represented and how they were defined at the time his career started. Clearly what was an acceptable practice regarding language, conduct and tactics in the 1940's and 1950's would, in most instances, not be acceptable today. Examining the acceptable approach of resolving a domestic violence situation can draw a contrast and comparison. The proper resolution in 1939, as described by Mast, was to take the suspect to the lock-up located behind the firehouse for a counseling session. This involved the officer and wife-beater establishing a common ground whereby the officer would be overcome with the desire to beat up the wife-beater. At the conclusion of the counseling session, the officer would return the husband home and all would be forgiven. This approach could have been very effective at the time for at least some incidents.

Today, a similar situation would require the officer to perform extensive counseling and mediation, a telephone call to the on-site counseling service provider, mandatory arrest if there were injuries, provide medical aid, possible transport to a local women's shelter, the obtaining of a temporary restraining order, provide domestic violence handouts containing social service programs for victims, take photographs of injuries, seize any firearms located within the home and suspects and an eight to ten page report.

In Mast's professional working environment, the punishment was of a physical nature with the culprit returned home rather quickly. In today's professional environment, once adjudicated, a defendant in San Mateo County could expect consequences to be quite severe. On average they will serve 10-60 days in jail depending on the severity of the injuries, 18 months supervised probation, 18 months unsupervised court probation, mandatory attendance of 104 hours of domestic violence counseling within 18 months of sentencing, a return to court every 3 months for judicial status review, be subject to search and seizure, no possession of weapons and/or ammunition, a fine of \$100 to be paid to a battered women's shelter, a \$200 fine to be paid to a domestic violence victim fund, and \$110 restitution payment to the court.<sup>3</sup> Quite a difference in consequences and final resolution.

Using the 1930's as a benchmark for the beginning of a review of how far law enforcement has progressed as a profession offers an interesting historical perspective. Policing in the 1930s United States was feeling the effects of corruption fueled by the prohibition on alcohol in the 1920s. As a result, a movement was underway to dismantle and separate the police from political powers that be.<sup>4</sup> Police professionalism was defined by the effectiveness of crime control. Crime Commissions were formed to study the

current wave of crime and how best to respond to it. The message was clear: Get tough on crime. FBI Director J. Edgar Hoover at the Attorney Generals' Conference succinctly described the mood of society and law enforcement on crime in 1934 when he said:

John Dillinger, the flagbearer of lawlessness, is dead, killed by Federal bullets. 'Pretty Boy' Floyd, who for years laughed at the law, lies in his grave, dead of gunshot wounds inflicted in open battle by our special agents. The career of 'Baby Face' Nelson is over; he died of seventeen bullet wounds while two of the finest men I ever knew gave their own clean lives that they might serve society by ending his filthy one. Wilbur Underhill no longer carries the name of the Tri-State Terror. He too is gone as well as such men as Homer Van Meter, Tommy Carroll and others. That is progress.

However behind this aggressive move on crime and attempts at furthering professionalism, was, in some areas, rampant police corruption. To further illustrate, a 1949 article in the Saturday Evening Post entitled "Why Good Cops Go Bad" describes an incident involving a Captain with a larger metropolitan police department. The author gave the Captain the fictitious name of Gus Blawker. The author describes the process that Blawker had to endure in order to be hired as a police officer and the eventual downfall of the Captain because he continued to work within the corrupt system.<sup>5</sup>

Blawker first wanted to be a police officer in the early 1930s and filled out an application. Shortly thereafter, a representative from the city visited Blawker and informed him of a requirement to pay \$300 in order to be eligible to take the entrance examination. When Blawker questioned this, he was told that other cities charged up to \$2,400 to be a police officer. Further, the man said if Blawker tried to fight it in court, that there were other ways to keep him from being hired. After much thought and hesitation, Blawker eventually raised the money and gave it to the representative.

A short time later the representative informed Blawker that some of his extended family that resided in the community was not registered right. The man explained that the current political representative for the District was up for reelection and Blawker's entire family would need to register as members of the representative's party so they could vote for him. Blawker's family registered with the intent to vote for the political representative and Blawker was promised a job right after the election.

The district representative was reelected and shortly thereafter Blawker was sworn in as a new police officer by the on-duty sergeant. He was provided a handbook to study and assigned to a field-training officer for two weeks. His trainer told Blawker that he should get to know the milkman and breadman because they both know what is going in the neighborhood when the cops aren't around. The trainer also provided some sage advice for the rookie by telling him; "They expect you to be smarter than an asshole lawyer for \$5.00 a day."

Over the years, Blawker made his way up the ranks working a variety of assignments including vice, traffic and detectives. Along the way, however, he also learned that corruption was rampant in the organization much beyond the original \$300 he had to pay to be hired. Merchants paid bribes for extra protection and gambling houses were shook-down for their money by the police. Eventually, Blawker became a Captain, but he continued his participation in the corruption, often dealing in stolen property and other illegal activities.

But times were slowly changing and efforts were underway to rid police departments of such activities. Blawker either failed to realize the change or could not control himself. He was eventually caught, prosecuted and convicted. The author cites the

system that Blawker was hired and worked in as a major contributing factor to his demise. It could be inferred that Blawker also failed to realize that the professional state of police work was changing, and he was unable to adapt to that change. As is the case today, law enforcement continues to change at an ever faster rate, and it is paramount that all officers equal this pace and adapt.

Professionalism took new turns from the 1950s to the 1970s. Being tough on crime was still the working order, but the definition of professionalism took on expanding notions. An examination of some of the criteria used to define professionalism and the efforts to increase the professional standard reveals an ever-changing evolution. The book *Police Forces in History*, by George L. Mosse, notes that the concept of police professionalism is often associated with attempts to ensure that officers are honest, responsible and competent. In addition, there needs to be a body of knowledge gathered via research and experience.

Of particular importance is the observation that a police professional is a combination of complimentary characteristics that speak to, and reflect, performance. Mosse observes:

For many people in society, the term *profession* tends to suggest that an occupation is important and the person in the occupation has considerable prestige and status (e.g. doctor, lawyer, and engineer). The acceptance and recognition by the public that an occupation is a profession usually results in higher pay. In addition it suggests that a person is an “expert” in some area. . . Consequently, attempts to gain recognition as a profession may have widespread support among occupational members, even when there is considerable resistance to doing the things required to become a profession.

Note the reference to pay and other examples of accepted professions. Law enforcement professionals share many of the same characteristics that the other

professions listed possess - except salary and the professional across-the-board mindset that accompanies salary.

The numerous changes in society law enforcement and advances in technology eventually resulted in police becoming too distant from the public. Exasperating the problem was the ever-faster population growth expanding over longer distances. This distance was further compounded by increased use of the automobile and advances in technology, such as the two-way mobile radio, telephone and eventually computers.

### **Law Enforcement as a Profession**

Currently in our society, law enforcement is in a position where the definition of our profession is changing at an ever-faster rate. Officers are called upon to solve a variety of complex social problems. The working definition is constantly in flux as customers place further and expanding demands on the services they expect.

Community Policing is becoming a blended mixture of various philosophies often referred to as “problem-solving”, “one-stop shopping”, “working in partnership”, and “the Nordstrom’s approach” of customer service. These definitions are the driving force behind the expansion of police service capabilities. No longer incident driven, officers are expected to be problem solvers and facilitators. To truly have “one-stop shopping” means that the definition and needs of the customer are determined by the customer in partnership with the law enforcement professional – or the service provider. As a result, law enforcement will continue to experience the need to reexamine itself to ensure that it is meeting the needs of the customer. Increased demands and complexities calls for increased professional capabilities and a higher standard. Higher standards and expectations means professionalism and the need to be paid like a professional.

What are the characteristics of a profession? Webster's New World Dictionary defines profession as ". . . an occupation requiring advanced academic training, as law, medicine, etc."

Using this definition as a reference point, an examination of what law enforcement has in common with other accepted professions in California reveals the following:<sup>6</sup>

Physicians:

- Base Education: Undergraduate Degree
- Advanced Education: Six years medical school
- Training: Residency
- Salary: Range of \$60,000 to \$96,000 annually to start
- Developed specialty pays \$154,800 to \$199,200

Attorneys:

- Base Education: Undergraduate Degree
- Advanced Education: Two years of law school
- Training: Varies depending on chosen specialty
- Salary: Range of \$42,960 to \$124,800

Civil Engineers:

- Base Education: Undergraduate Degree
- Advanced Education: Varies depending on Specialty
- Salary: Range of \$42,960 to \$124,800 annually

### California Police Officers:

- Base Education: Varies from high school diploma to under graduate degree depending on organizational requirements
- A minimum of 6 months training at the basic academy level
- An average of 16 weeks of field training
- A minimum of 24 hours of advanced officer training every two-years
- Salary: Range of \$30,000 to \$78,000 annually

Other similarities include licensing, accreditation, recertification, expertise in their field, public respect and scrutiny, high expectations, high-profile in the media and a distinctive appearance (uniforms).

However, one area that is dissimilar is the absence of a salary reimbursement model for the line-level police professional. Law enforcement has made tremendous advances in its pursuit of professionalism. However, the profession itself and the members within it are extremely hesitant to take the final step towards true professional status and be in line with other professions of equal importance to society. "Police want to call themselves professionals but still bargain like the United Auto Workers Union, focusing on an hourly wage and benefits," observes Dr. Steven Vicchio.<sup>7</sup> Exploration of potential alternative approaches while asking if continuing the status quo will have a stifling effect on how law enforcement is viewed by those served will help pave the way for future change and growth. Will Law enforcement continue to hear the occasional cries of "it's not my job" and work under an industrial era compensation model or develop a job description that places no limitations?

### **The Responsibility of Management**

Management needs to change their approach as well. In her book *Leadership and the New Science*, Margaret J. Wheatley observes that organizational managers need to change

from complex leadership styles and management controls and search for a simpler way to lead, one that requires less effort and results in less stress.<sup>8</sup> This is based on the discovery in physics that space between objects is not void of material as previously thought. Rather, “space” has a direct effect on objects and can be used to build relationships and change. This concept is described as a movement towards “holism” – understanding the total ramifications of relationships in the workplace. Wheatley observes:

That because we understand one we must understand two because one plus one equals two. But we now have to understand the “and”. Motivation must no longer be driven by external rewards. The employee value system is changing to intrinsic rewards – meaning, community, dignity and love in the organizational life. We must break the separation philosophy of love is for home and discipline is for work. The concept of “love” must be reintroduced into the workplace.

Through this new order, dynamics relationships are formed and the chaotic structure actually becomes ordered resulting in a richer, more creative force. This results in a new scientific management approach. People are delighted by surprises instead of fearing them. The shift in participative management is not some passing fad. Instead, its formation is based on the changing order and organization of the physical universe itself. The better employees feel about the organization, the more work will be done. It is this self-reference that is the key for management. Acknowledging that individuals are an important part of an ever-changing chaotic system and welcoming the dynamic change that it brings.

It continues to be an interesting paradox that law enforcement officers view themselves as professionals and yet negotiate for a salary wage in the same manner as those officers who started their careers with Officer Mast. To expand further, officers negotiate in the same manner that workers holding jobs related to the Industrial model do,

such as factory workers and other labor oriented careers. Nothing is wrong with these admirable jobs, but are they considered professions in the sense that law enforcement desires to describe itself? Certainly, law enforcement managers consider themselves professionals. As such, they are usually on a salary system. Why the distinction? Certainly the answer does not rest with the notion that managers are more professional than the line level police officer.

Is it possible to implement a straight salary system? What would be the effects of such a salary system and what issues would be encountered? Can a professional paradigm shift be accomplished that benefits all involved? Such transitions have occurred in other professions, such as lawyers, doctors and the academic arena, with incredible results. Advancements in medicine, attorneys paving the way for civil rights enhancements and increased educational standards are just a few of the examples that support this conclusion.

## Chapter II

### Forecasting the Future

#### Nominal Group Technique

To help determine the effects a salary system would have on the line level police officer, the organization and the community and aid the research process, a group of individuals from various professions were convened who could provide insight regarding possible future trends and events. In addition, this group identified the potential effects a salary system could have on the critical stakeholders. The Nominal Group Technique (NGT) was utilized to gather this information from the group and was integrated into the research.

The nominal group technique (NGT) was used to facilitate the formation of this project's strategic plan. The NGT is a structured workshop/meeting/process, which identifies and ranks major trends and events affecting the topic. It is also used for managing participation in such processes as planning, performance improvement and measurement. The method is effective at gaining consensus with all types and levels of participants in a wide range of settings. Further, it offers a perspective on scenarios, which allows for pre-planning and influence towards the desired outcome or future state. For this project, examples of trends/effects could include the impact on other bargaining groups, pay scales, media attention and morale. Examples of future events could include privatization of police services, economic recession and a reduction in the pool of qualified police officer candidates.

The group consisted of individuals from diverse backgrounds, which provided a representative sample of labor and management bodies that could provide insight and

unique perspective on how this event would impact the people they represented.

Participating members included a Sergeant from the San Jose Police Department, who had served as President of the San Jose Police Officers' Association for ten years, a retired past President of the San Jose Police Officers' Association, the Assistant City Manager, Personnel Director and Finance Director for the City of San Carlos, a Police Commander from the San Carlos Police Department, who served as Chief of Police for ten years with another agency, a Police Commander from a San Mateo County police agency, a Police Chief from a San Mateo County Police Department and the current President of the San Carlos Police Officers' Association.

Prior to the NGT, the group was provided an information packet explaining the process and asking one question to provoke thought: *What would be the affects of placing line level police officers in a mid-sized organization on a straight salary system by the year 2008?*

The group was then provided background information, a strategic purpose and various definitions, which are presented below.

### **Background Information**

Since the societal changes of the 1960s, law enforcement in the United States has mandated by those we serve to attain a "professional" status on par with other accepted professions such as doctors, lawyers and engineers. Although law enforcement has made great strides towards this lofty goal by increasing hiring standards, education requirements, training and salaries, much progress is still needed.

For my topic I intend to explore the impact of placing police officers at the line level in a mid-sized organization on a salary pay system similar to other professions. Could

this be the last hurdle that needs to be cleared before law enforcement attains a truly professional status?

**Nominal Group Technique:**

A structured workshop/meeting/process, which identifies and ranks the major trends and events effecting the topic. The method is effective at gaining consensus with all types and level of participants in a wide range of settings.

**Trends:**

Any ongoing occurrence which has an impact on placing law enforcement officers on a straight salary system.

**Events:**

A single occurrence which has an impact on placing law enforcement officers on a straight salary system.

**Nominal Group Process:**

During the NGT process the group was asked to consider the trends that would have an impact in the event officers were placed on a straight salary compensation model.

The group was led through the NGT process, which consists of silent idea generation in written form, round robin verbalization until all ideas are exhausted, group clarification of the posted ideas, voting, ranking and discussion of the results. The group initially generated 76 trends and 68 events. Eventually, the group narrowed to ten the most important trends and events that could have the greatest impact on the stated topic. It was determined through discussion the likelihood of the trend/event occurring in a given period of time, impact of the trend/event on the topic and whether the impact was positive or negative. This was accomplished through a cross-impact analysis, with each group

member providing input regarding the potential ramifications the trends and events would have on the topic. The trends and events were then used to forecast three potential future scenarios. Tables 2.1, 2.2 and 2.3 contain the information gathered from the NGT process.

## TRENDS

TRENDS	-5 YEARS	TODAY	+ 5 YEARS	+10 YEARS	CONCERN 1-10
Recruitment of New Officers (T-1)	75	100	150	150	9
Impact on Shift Differential, Overtime Pay and Extra Shifts (T-2)	120	100	100	100	8
Retention of Officers (T-3)	100	100	125	140	9
Valuing and Compensating Extra Work Time and System Transition (T-4)	75	100	110	120	9
Predictability of Budgets, Over- time Management and Training (T-5)	100	100	100	120	8
Concern for Inequitable Workload Distribution (T-6)	80	100	125	125	7
Community Policing (T-7)	50	100	125	150	8
Approaches to Discipline (T-8)	95	100	125	125	7
Labor Union Relations/Issues (T-9)	100	100	110	120	9
Officer Motivation (T-10)	100	100	125	140	8

**Table 2.1**  
NGT Future Trends Affecting a Transition to a Salary System

Note: Table Definition: The values listed in each column represents the group's subjective analysis of the individual trend development beginning 5 years prior to "today", which is represented with the arbitrary value of 100, and concluding with a quantitative estimation of 5 and 10 years from present day.

## EVENTS

EVENTS	0 YEARS	+ 5 YEARS %	+ 10 YEARS %	CONCERNS 1-10	IMPACT + OR -
Change in Political, Administrative or Leadership Structures (E-1)	1	100	100	10	+/-
Binding Arbitration (E-2)	1	50	100	9	-
Metro Consolidation (E-3)	4	10	20	7	-
Change in Labor Law (FLSA) (E-4)	2	100	100	8	-
Media Coverage of Police Scandal Related to Topic (E-5)	4	50	85	6	-
Contract for Police Services (E-6)	4	10	66	7	+/-
Court Decision Barring Salary (E-7)	1	10	20	10	-
Success of Another Salary System (E-8)	2	10	20	8	+
Economic Downturn (E-9)	3	50	55	8	-
Crime Rate Reaches All Time Low (E-10)	1	50	60	4	+

Table 2.2

Note: The value "0 years" represents the group's estimation of the first year the probability of the events occurring exceeds zero. The subsequent columns of "5 and 10 years" represent the group's determination of the probability of the event occurring. The last column represents whether the event has a positive or negative effect on the issue.

## CROSS IMPACT ANALYSIS

### T - Trend

EVENT	T-1	T-2	T-3	T-4	T-5	T-6	T-7	T-8	T-9	T-10
E-1	+10	-5	-2	0	+2	0	+6	+5	+5	+5
E-2	0	0	+7	0	+3	0	0	0	+10	+10
E-3	0	+3	+5	0	0	0	+5	0	0	0
E-4	+10	-8	0	+7	+3	0	0	0	+4	-5
E-5	0	0	-2	0	0	0	0	-5	-5	-10
E-6	+5	-5	+4	+3	+2	0	0	-5	0	-10
E-7	-10	-8	-8	-3	-4	0	0	0	0	-5
E-8	+10	+5	+10	+8	+7	0	0	0	+5	+10
E-9	-3	-6	+7	-2	-2	0	-5	0	0	-5
E-10	-6	-2	0	-3	0	0	+8	0	0	0

**Table 2.3**

This table represents a cross impact analysis between the event and trends listed by the NGT Panel. When quantifying the impact, I attempted to determine the impact from the perspective of the panel member's concern expressed during clarification discussion.

**Analysis:**

Numerous significant impacts based on the cross impact analysis were determined.

The following is a summary of the most significant ones:

The most significant areas include a highly probable positive effect on recruitment of officers (T-1) if a change in organizational leadership structure (E-1), a change in the Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA) (E-4) and success of another salary system in another police agency were to occur. A highly probable negative impact could occur for this event if a court barred a salary system (E-7) for police officers.

The group felt that concern for inequitable workload distribution (T-6) would neither be positively or negatively impacted by any of the listed events.

Officer motivation (T-10) could be adversely effected if media coverage of a police scandal (E-5) and contract for police services (E-6) were to occur; however, the salary concept could be positive effected if success of a salary system in another agency were to occur (E-8).

**Scenarios:**

Scenarios are developed based on input from the Nominal Group and are used to determine potential future outcomes. Once scenarios are identified, then strategic planning can be undertaken to plan for and influence the projected future state and/or desired outcome.

The following describes three possible future scenarios for the topic based upon discussion of the NGT group and subsequent research.

### **Best Case Scenario:**

*The development of this scenario stems from the ideas, events and trends developed by the participants of the Nominal Group Technique.*

The Santa Paula Police Officers' Association was preparing for contract negotiations with City Management. Senior Patrol Officer Bill Youngman was the POA President, and he knew negotiations were going to be difficult. The POA was in the last year of a 4-year contract. In retrospect it was a mistake to sign a contract for so long. But in 2004 it seemed to make sense. Bill was a supporter of the 4-year contract at the time and no one could have forecast the tremendous inflation rate that occurred during the length of the contract. As a result, the officers were the lowest paid in the area, leaving the officers with the feeling that the City did not care about them.

Also, Bill and his Grievance Committee Chairperson, Mike Siuyam, had been very busy bringing the numerous POA grievances from its members to management. They did not blame the officers for not wanting to work mandatory overtime. Everyone has a family they reasoned, and besides, the Department should hire more officers, even though the ones they hired were not as good as when they started. Everything was a fight and both knew negotiations were going to be a major battle. But someone had to lead the charge and they were just the ones to do it.

Bill and Mike sat down for a cup of coffee with their attorney, John Bellows, to discuss strategy before meeting with management. Bill remarked he could not believe how far management had taken community policing. "It's ridiculous," he said, "We play nursemaid to these people, and they don't even know how lousy we are paid. If I have to solve one more problem that has nothing to do with real police work, I might just quite

and make more money doing something else. No one appreciates us, and it's high time we get paid for what we are worth." The others nodded in agreement and silent disgust.

The group met for a while and decided on the usual benefits and salary package. The POA would not settle for anything less than a 9% cost of living adjustment (COLA) in addition to an increased benefits package. They left the table and entered the room with the usual expectations. . . and management was waiting.

Personnel Director Jim Peterson was seated at the table flanked by Assistant City Manager Sandy Scaper and City Negotiator Cindy Noway. Tensions were high as the POA representatives laid out their proposal. Bill concluded by saying any offer by the City that was less than what the POA was asking for could result in protracted negotiations, low morale, a no confidence vote of the Chief and POA members taking their grievances and unhappiness to the citizens and the media.

Negotiator Cindy Noway leaned back in her chair looked at Bill and said, "What you are asking for is not enough if you consider yourself professional police officers. If you want to be viewed as a profession, then you need be paid like professionals and you need to work and act like professionals."

Noway then presented the City's offer. Each officer would be placed on a salary system and receive an automatic \$10,000 a year salary increase. In return, there would be no overtime pay. When the need for overtime arose, then it would be filled on a rotation basis without overtime.

Bill and the others were shocked and had no idea this was coming. They asked for a short break so they could caucus.

There was much skepticism about the offer. Was it fair? What about those officers who did more? Had to go to court more? Some said other officers would be motivated to do less because there was no court overtime – no incentive. Management would surely take advantage of them.

After a long discussion, the POA representatives said they would present the offer at the next POA meeting. The POA voted to accept the offer. During the following year, many positive changes occurred. Police Officer vacancies quickly filled and retention problems were non-existent because the Department became the highest paid agency in the area. Overtime was filled on a rotation basis and everyone felt it was done in a fair manner. Grievances became almost non-existent as compensation issues were eliminated. Most importantly, implementation of the salary system created a new synergistic environment. Officers took responsibility for all aspects of the organization. Productivity was raised 30% with morale at an all-time high. The community was amazed at the level of customer service. Professionalism had finally come and everyone was reaping the rewards.

**Middle-of-the-Road Scenario:**

Chief Thomas stood up from her chair. The look of frustration on her face was clear as she said in an exasperated voice to her Command Staff, “We have to stop our officers from leaving for other departments. We have to do something. Our patrol staff is down 25%, and I can’t find qualified candidates to fill these positions. On top of this, the City Council has authorized two more positions to help our Community Policing program. Only one person put in for the recent detective position, no one wants the K-9 position and we have a traffic motorcycle sitting in the garage because we can’t find anyone who

wants to ride it. In years past, everyone wanted these plumbs and now we can't give them away!"

Captain Gannon, who normally disliked any new ideas, raised his hand and said, "I have an idea that may help us out."

"Go ahead it's got to be better than what I've heard so far." Chief Thomas said.

Captain Gannon asked, "Why don't we negotiate with the POA to have officers working specialized positions like detective, traffic and K-9 be paid a straight salary?" This will motivate people to apply for these positions because they will pay more. Also, we will be able to pick the cream-of-the-crop because the best will be applying."

Chief Thomas said, "I heard this idea before. Some nut wrote about this 10 years ago. I think it had something to do with Command College. Everyone thought it was joke at the time, but, maybe, the time is right now."

After further discussion and negotiation, it was decided to give this new idea a try. Eventually, anytime an opening came up for one of these positions, many officers submitted for it. This ensured that the best were taken while others strive to become better qualified. The organization became a dynamic one and soon other lateral officers and new recruits wanted to work for the department. Recruiting became easier and quality of people testing was improved. They planned to eventually examine if the entire organization could be placed on salary.

#### **Worst Case Scenario:**

Realizing that one works for an organization that is unwilling to change and explore new ways of doing business is a major contributing factor towards a lack of job satisfaction and motivation. Equally frustrating would be the frustration of management

because they feel they cannot accomplish anything of meaning. This is truly the definition of a dysfunctional organization.

Everyone present could hear the words of the team-building consultant around the room. All work groups of the organization were present for what was thought to be a launch point for a new beginning. But no one was paying attention because they knew the rhetoric. They had heard it many times before. Commitment to change that never seemed to happen. Or if it did, it soon disappeared into the deep crevasse of organizational malfunction.

Then, Officer Ray Rothchild, a new officer who never said much, decided to take a chance and proclaimed, "Hey, I have a thought." Everyone looked at Ray as he told about this idea he had read about. He said that maybe the new thing everyone was looking for was paying officers a salary. Ray reasoned that this definitely would be something new. "After all", Ray said, "Other professionals are paid a salary and if we are to consider ourselves a profession, then we should be paid one too.

The response from the rest of group was immediate and swift.

"Rookie", said veteran Officer Muldoone.

"Golden Boy", whispered the POA President.

The consultant, attempting to restore order to the process, said "Change can be good, but I can see that this type of change is just going to be too much so let's move on to something productive."

At the next break, Sgt. Johnson pulled Ray aside and said, "You know what, kid? That wasn't a bad idea. But, one day you'll see it can be real tough changing something in this business. It's better to be days ahead of your time than years. Think about it!"

**Conclusion:**

The Nominal Group Technique, through its exploration of potential trends and events laid the foundation for the development of a strategic plan necessary to influence the potential future and desired outcome. Further, the NGT identified the possible effects a salary system could have on the critical stakeholders. Having this information creates the opportunity for developing the strategic plan and determining the best approach to take.

## Chapter III

### Strategic Plan

#### **Summary:**

The purpose of a strategic plan is to help facilitate and manage a desirable future for the organization and individuals. The formation of the strategic plan is based on the identified trends and events that could potentially impact the issue. The individual(s) responsible for the design and implementation of the plan must look for opportunities to influence the future – to bring the future to present day. In addition, can we plan for, prevent or cause to happen a trend and/or event that creates the desirable outcome and future we are looking for.

The following model provides a framework for an analytical approach for law enforcement management and labor representatives who wish to implement a salary system for all line level officers. This model is based on the assumption that a desirable outcome is the implementation of a salary system. In addition, there is the assumption that the interpretation of the Fair Labor Standards Act (FLSA) has been mitigated by labor/management negotiation or judicial ruling, modified or no longer in existence. The Fair Labor Standards Act mandates that a worker (officer in this case) be paid overtime when they work in excess of 40 hours per week. Line level police officers, unlike police management, are not viewed as “exempt” (from this requirement) employees. Realizing that there are many who would oppose this concept, following this model at least provides a neutral research approach that should further attempts to mitigate allegations of bias and skepticism.

## **Professional Paradigm Shift**

The premise of the paradigm shift rests upon the concept that law enforcement has reached the professional level that it must commit to taking the last step towards true professional status. This concept does not end there. Rather this would be the beginning of a total revolution on how we perceive ourselves as an occupation, how the public and the various political structures view law enforcement.

Post salary implementation could result in a synergistic process that would create a true problem solving, a strong drive to meet customer service needs, less labor adversary during negotiations and less disciplinary actions.

## **Situational Analysis – The STEEP Model (STEEP)**

As with any major change, careful navigation involving all the various involved parties must be adhered to. This analysis of what lies ahead in one's environment can be accomplished by using the STEEP model. The STEEP model provides a point of reference by examining five competing forces: Social, Technological, Economic, Environmental and Political.<sup>9</sup> These competing factors can greatly influence and affect the strategy to be used when implementing a salary program.

### **Social**

- Changing view of law enforcement
- Erosion of public trust
- Greater demands for problem solving approach
- Variety of social issues
- Changing employee value systems
- Creating a new work environment
- “Graying” of society

### **Technological**

- Faster pace of technological change
- Greater and faster community awareness of police activities through the media
- Opportunity for faster reporting of criminal activity

### **Environmental**

- Growing population
- Added stress within the community
- Diverse language needs

### **Economic**

- Demand and competition for qualified candidates
- Continued robust economy diverts potential candidates to private sector
- Need for increased pay to compete

### **Political**

- Demand for police to solve a wide variety of social problems
- Public distrust of government institutions
- Demands on public officials to combat crime

### **Analysis of the Organizational Culture**

Every progressive and dynamic organization must periodically reexamine itself as objectively as possible to determine its health and the direction it is going in. Prior to an organizational change of this magnitude, the Command Staff must be able to listen to what members of the organization are feeding back to them as far as the health of the organization. One model that can be used for the analysis of an organization is “WOTS UP” – Weaknesses, Opportunities, Threats and Strengths.

**Weaknesses** – What does the organization need to do to prepare itself for the pending change

- Is the organization prepared for a change of this magnitude?
- Is the political structure of the municipality prepared for a change of this type?
- Will the public embrace the concept?
- Do the officers support and buy-in to the plan?
- Is management and officers prepared to make the change?

**Opportunities** – potential benefits derived from transition to salary system

- It will increase annual pay across the board
- It will increase recruitment capabilities
- It could improve retention capabilities
- The concept could culturally change the organization to a broader perspective
- It could improve productivity
- Education standards could be increased
- It may result in less disciplinary issues
- Negotiations may be less adversarial
- A “professional” mentality could permeate the organization

**Threats** – potential adversity that could hinder implementation of a salary system

- POA opposition to the concept
- City Management not ready to support the change
- Perceived inequities between the officers
- Could result in lowered performance by some officers
- Other City bargaining groups may want the same benefit
- May not result in desired change in professional status
- Parties may not trust each other

**Strengths** – organizational readiness to accept salary system

- Strong desire to be paid as a professional
- Desire to strive for continued professional development
- Culture of change acceptance strong in organizational fabric
- Desire to change view of job specific duties

### **Identification of Stakeholders and Analysis**

To ensure maximum opportunity for success, an identification of individuals and groups – critical stakeholders in the process – and an analysis of their position must be accomplished. Stakeholders, because of their position, can have an impact on what one is attempting to accomplish. They can be supportive, indifferent or oppose the change. Stakeholders can be part of the organization, the political structure, a citizen group, any other group or individuals that could be affected by the change.

Stakeholders can have differing levels of involvement in the change process. This involvement can include:

- **Inclusion** in the change process
- **Recognition** as a contributing source to the change process
- **Informed** of the progression and/or data pertaining to the change process
- **Leadership** or change agent for the change process
- **Data** pertaining to the change process

Stakeholders who could potentially have an interest in, or be impacted by, a transition to a salary system are listed in Table 3.1.

STAKEHOLDER	INCLUSION	RECOGNITION	INFORMATION	LEADERSHIP	DATA
Police Labor Group	X	X	X	X	X
Police Management	X	X	X	X	X
City Council	X	X	X		X
City Manager	X	X	X		X
Personnel Director	X	X	X	X	X
Community		X	X		X
Finance Director		X	X		X
City Attorney	X	X	X		X
Other City Groups		X	X		

**Table 3.1**

Represents identification if critical stakeholders. "X" represents need for involvement as it relates to the particular category.

### **Development of Alternative Strategies:**

The question for law enforcement executives is what role should they take when attempting to implement a salary system and organizational change in culture? Change agents possess three basic alternative strategies when attempting transition to a new concept:

1. Indifference to the issue or maintaining the current state
  - Management need do nothing but observe the progression of the shift towards a salary system and address the issue at the appropriate point in the transition

process. There remains the possibility of being viewed as opposing the concept and losing the opportunity to play an active role in the development of a new form of compensation.

2. Management can elect to participate in the change process to salary system, but not take an active leadership role.
  - Management participates in the process but does not actively lead and/or promote the idea. Rather, the role is one of passive participation without strong commitment to change.
  
3. Strong, active leadership and promotion of idea coupled with a willingness to work in partnership with the critical stakeholders to make the transition to a salary system a reality.
  - This strategy ensures maximum effectiveness and opportunity for success.  
  
Management plays a strong leadership role and is committed to making the change. The counter to this position is the possibility of bearing blame in the event the concept does not work as effectively as projected.

#### **Stakeholder Analysis:**

It is imperative to analyze the role that each stakeholder will play and the impact they will have on the change process. Depending on their position for a salary system – for or against – careful attention must be given to either maintain or gain their support. The following provides a basic starting point to minimize and/or enhance a stakeholder's position:

#### Police Labor Group

- Resistance and opposition to the concept can be expected. Education, open discussion, consensus building and working in partnership can improve the chances for agreement.

Police Management:

- No abuses of new system, must develop trust and promote the desired culture that the change should bring. Management must be willing to continually examine the process in partnership with the labor group.

City Council:

- Must have initial buy-in kept informed throughout the process.

City Manager:

- Must have initial buy-in and continual support. Benefits of the transition must be explained and input sought.

Personnel Director:

- Will be expected to be an active member of the negotiation team. Must be willing to mitigate adversarial relationship and build partnership approach.

Community:

- Careful explanation of the benefits and expected increase in service is essential.

Finance Director:

- Input sought on technical matters.

City Attorney:

- Assist and clarify legal issues.

Other City Employee Groups:

- Kept apprised of the progress and eventual outcome.

Gathering this data from analysis of the critical stakeholders allows for constructing a potential future state should implementation be desirable. In the next chapter, the potential effects of salary system implementation will be explored. To assist with the analysis, an organization was constructed and designed to represent a typical California law enforcement agency.

## **Chapter IV**

### **Salary Implementation**

What ramifications would exist for the critical stakeholders if a salary system were to be implemented? This question could be answered by focusing on the answers to the following questions:

1. Is law enforcement ready to take this step?
2. What would be the effects?
3. What would the landscape of the profession look like – shift in paradigm?

#### **The Model Organization:**

A model organization must first be created to examine the affects a straight salary system would have if implemented. Though fictitious in nature, this model serves as an excellent test case for implementation. There needs to be the assumption that implementation of a salary system is possible and desirable by all critical stakeholders. The following city and organization represents a typical mid-sized California community and police department.

#### **The City:**

The City of Santa Paula is located in Central California and has a population of 32,200, covering 6 square miles. It is predominantly a bedroom community consisting of middle to upper income families. Most of the working residents commute to a larger city 30 miles away to what would be considered mostly white-collar occupations. The city does boast a large industrial and commercial area and has been fiscally well managed by its City Council and City Manager form of government.

## **The Police Department:**

The Santa Paula Police Department is well respected in the law enforcement community. It places a premium on high customer service and recently fully adopted the community-policing concept. The Department consists of 40 sworn officers – (1) Chief, (2) Commanders, (1) Administrative Lieutenant, (8) Sergeants (one dedicated to investigations; all are members of the Police Officers Association), (24) Patrol Officers and (4) Detectives. The Community Policing Unit is incorporated into the patrol division. In addition to the sworn staff, the department has (23) non-sworn positions, (14) of which are full-time employees. Non-sworn staff consists of Dispatchers, Records Technicians, Community Service Officers and Administrative Support. Thirty-six officers are non-salaried employees.

Similar to many California agencies, the Santa Paula Police Department has experienced recruitment difficulties (finding qualified candidates) and retention problems caused by officers using the department as a training ground and opting to leave for the larger, nearby agency where diverse opportunities and higher pay can be found. The current pay scale follows the traditional “step-increase” model of 5% increases annually and is as follows:

- First Step:           \$47,856 + \$7,925 (average overtime) = \$55,781
- Second Step:       \$50,259 + \$7,925 = \$58,184
- Third Step:         \$52,770 + \$7,925 = \$60,695
- Fourth Step:        \$54,419 + \$7,925 = \$62,344
- Fifth Step:          \$58,176 + \$7,925 = \$66,101

**Budget:**

Total Operating Budget of \$6,559,619. The department budgets \$205,000 annually for overtime; however, the department traditionally exceeds the budgeted amount by 15% on average - or \$235,750. Holiday pay is budgeted at \$71,300. These figures represent the sworn staff to be affected by the transition to salary (numbering 36).

Analysis of overtime expenditure for the previous year reveals that the individual officer worked an average of 184.4 hours of overtime. This equates to an average earning of \$7,925 per officer per year resulting from overtime. The high was 412 hours of overtime and the low was 108.5. The high overtime earning was \$16,645 and the low \$2,560.

**Post Transition Issues and Potential Resolutions:**

Labor Group:

Issue: The NGT Panel cited distrust of management and potential management abuse when allocating overtime.

Solution: Fostering trust through sound management practice as cited in this study should mitigate this concern. Potential management abuse of overtime allocation can be eliminated through monitoring and tracking of overtime. In this manner, overtime assignment can be accomplished through volunteer and a rotation/tracking system.

Overtime:

Issue: What should be done when an officer works overtime?

Solution: When the overtime is related to staffing shortages, late calls, the need for extra personnel or emergencies, assignment can be made on a rotation basis to ensure equitable distribution. Court related overtime would be eliminated through the use of other reward systems noted below.

Holiday Pay: Unaffected

### Discipline:

A projection of affects on discipline is difficult to determine. Depending on the interpretation of FLSA and the Abshire decision, discipline could take many forms. Final resolution most likely would come from a judicial determination or labor/management agreement. One potential outcome is the determination that salaried officers do not meet the Abshire test because they do not meet the “performing executive duties” clause.<sup>14</sup>

### **Post Transition Benefits:**

#### Change in Mindset:

The potential for police cultural change is significant. Certainly police possess a professional mindset now. But to reach the next level means to accomplish any given task and constantly approach from a professional perspective.

#### Viewed as on Par with Other Professionals:

In conjunction with the change in mindset comes the perception from those we serve that we are truly a profession and such we should be treated, trained, trusted and compensated accordingly.

#### Retention:

By being the first or one of the first to make this transition and with implementation of the proposed management style, retention issues could virtually disappear.

#### Higher Pay:

Officers would be paid a \$64,724 annual salary. This figure was derived from adding the top-step salary to the projected overtime cost – which was divided by the number of overtime-eligible employees. This represents a 16.5% increase when compared to the

base entry salary. Overall, overtime would be distributed equally, resulting in an overall reduction of per-person overtime.

Negotiations:

Negotiations would be less adversarial, more open and less complicated.

**Conclusion:**

The opportunity and ability to develop an organization that reflects the preceding model paves the way for a dynamic organization that leads the way in its field by setting a futuristic example for other organizations to follow. This would be a bold, new concept for a profession that traditionally is extremely slow to react to changing times, let alone be at the forefront of change.

Since this would be an unprecedented step, it becomes necessary to search for a comparative model currently in use in order to examine the effects of salary implementation and gather additional information about successes and failures.

The quest to find a professional organization that could provide a comparative analysis to the law enforcement model led to the discovery of Worthington Industries – a steel manufacturing plant based in Columbus, Ohio. Although not a law enforcement agency, Worthington provides an excellent opportunity to examine an existing organization, which is part of a slow changing field that placed their line-level employees on a salary system

**Chapter V**  
**A Comparison Model**  
**Worthington Industries**

**Worthington Industries:**

A Command College instructor profiling the company highlighted the success of Worthington Industries. Tom Peters was the narrator and the video showed him at the company plant in Columbus, Ohio.

Worthington is a steel manufacturing company, which has metal cylinders as one of its major products. The cylinders are the types used to store propane for your barbecue and Freon for your refrigerator.

Mr. Peters talked about how the company went against steel industry existing standards for compensation by offering their line level employees a salary system and profit sharing. This, in-turn, raised productivity and morale. Absenteeism plummeted to a record 1.4%.

As research began, it became apparent that it may be possible to duplicate what Worthington was doing and produce the same professional environment in the police culture.

The research conducted at Worthington began by calling the company and asking if it would be possible to meet with members of management and employees working in the factory at the line level. Lori Cooper, Worthington Corporate Human Resources, who arranged for a research visit to the plant and meet with staff in Columbus, Ohio.

Driving to the Worthington complex for my 8:30 am appointment, the professionalism of this unique organization became quite evident. Approaching the guard shack at the

front gate, one would expect to see the typical security guard huddled inside as the weather was 15 degrees and very windy. Instead, found was a very pleasant and smiling elderly gentlemen who asked how he could help. Explained I was here to see Laurie Cooper, he said, "Please wait one moment, sir, and I will call her for you." He returned a moment later and directed me to the proper building.

### **The Company**

Mr. John H. McConnell founded Worthington Industries in 1955. Using his 1952 Oldsmobile as collateral he borrowed \$600 to purchase his first load of steel. During the subsequent year, five employees, using one piece of equipment sell \$342,000 worth of product, but only earn a net of \$11,000.

In 1959, Mr. McConnell purchased a two-acre site in Columbus, Ohio and built a 16,000 square foot facility. This is followed in 1961 with the installation of a new manufacturing system, which produces an improved product at a lower cost. In that same year the company purchases a steel processing plant in Louisville, Kentucky, marking the first expansion move.

1966 saw the beginning of a dynamic process that would set the mark for the company and its employees during the ensuing years. Against well-respected advice from local business leaders, Mr. McConnell implemented a first of a kind idea in the steel manufacturing business by providing a salary pay system for line level production employees and a profit sharing program, thus treating all employees as partners in the business.

The company made its first public stock offering in 1968. In 1971, Worthington became the leading producer of steel and aluminum low-pressure cylinders in the United

States. The 1970s brought continued expansion as other steel companies were purchased and the company moved into a new office building. In 1976 earnings surpassed the \$100,000,000 mark. Aggressive expansion continued through the 1980s with further steel acquisitions and the building of new plants at various locations around the country. In 1995 Worthington reported record results and John H. McConnell repeats what he said 40 years ago, “. . .we’ve only scratched the surface.”<sup>10</sup>

### **Philosophy**

An examination of the Worthington philosophy (excerpt) reveals the secret to their success. Each point is translated to law enforcement with an example of how and where this philosophy can be applied.

- We treat our customers, employees, investors and suppliers as we would like to be treated. The “Golden Rule” is critical to organizational success. I would add that employees must treat managers in the same vein as well. Vital to success in law enforcement, yet difficult to follow, this simple concept would eliminate many barriers to a professional mindset.
- We are dedicated to the belief that people are our most important asset. Realizing that many police departments believe and commit to this concept, there are many, if not more, which do not. Adoption of this philosophy would further a professional working environment.
- We believe people respond to recognition, opportunity to grow and fair compensation. Salary and elimination of an adversarial bargaining approach would further a positive working environment. Pro-active mentoring, training programs and specialty rotation provide such an opportunity.
- From employees we expect an honest day’s work for an honest day’s pay. Salary and a professional approach – any aspect during the day may be part of “the job”, not just what is traditionally narrowly defined by the job description flyer.

- We believe in the philosophy of continued employment for all Worthington employees. Retention through a positive working environment and increased salary.
- In filling job openings every effort is expended to find candidates within Worthington. Leadership creating the opportunity and environment for success through career development and in-house testing to further promote loyalty. Many law enforcement managers feel that loyalty is a thing of the past. They are probably correct to a degree, however the broader question is what have we done to foster retention and loyalty? Give it, expect it, and talk about it without giving up is the key.
- We will exert every effort to see that the customer's quality and service requirements are met. Community policing, partnerships and the highest professional order.
- Once a commitment is made to a customer, every effort is made to fulfill that obligation. Philosophy, commitment, training and being a part of the organizational fabric.
- All managers are given the operating latitude and authority to accomplish their responsibilities within our corporate goals and objectives. The ability to take risks, learn by your mistakes and truly "think outside the box". It may differ, but different can be encouraged within acceptable limits.
- In keeping with this philosophy, we do not create corporate procedures. If procedures are necessary within a particular company operation, that manager creates them. TRUST! And dealing with it appropriately when it is violated. Police Department rules and regulations continue to expand and become more complicated. Efforts must be made to develop and foster trust in the work environment and examine alternatives to manuals and regulations that are cumbersome.

## **Meeting with Worthington Staff**

Having read the philosophy statement on the wall in the front office, the meeting was convened with Laurie Cooper, Dwight (Ike) Kelley, Director, Corporate Personnel and Thomas L. Hockman, Vice President Personnel.

Explained were the concepts behind Command College and the reasons for the research visit to Worthington. The meeting was originally scheduled for one hour; however, it was concluded closer to two hours later. Many positive impressions were formed. One aspect that stood out was the strong commitment and belief to the corporate philosophy and to the importance of management modeling that belief every minute of every day. Management must treat employees like they (management) want to be treated.

The group explained the inner workings of Worthington Industries and how it is driven by the philosophy. All employees are full-time. Some full-time employees are termed seasonal as their employment is for a short period of time – usually three to four months – during the busy time of the year. Company practice is to hire only seasonal employees to fill vacant full-time positions whenever possible. A seasonal employee can only be hired after their team members and first-line supervisors vote them in. All employees are on salary. The probation period is for 3 months.

In addition to salary, part of the outstanding benefit package is no sick leave days. If an employee is sick, then they get paid. In the event of an extended illness beyond five days, then the employee is granted disability time. The company experiences very little system abuse to the point that is almost a non-issue for management. Indeed, their absenteeism rate is an astonishingly low 1.4% of total work time. If the need arises to

counsel someone, it is done in a constructive manner. Continued abuse results in a prorated reduction of profit sharing – a valuable benefit.

Employee evaluations are conducted every six months and focus on performance, housekeeping, attitude, attendance, career development, strengths and weaknesses. The plant has no janitorial services, so the employee is responsible for maintaining their work-space and the team is responsible for maintaining the general areas.

Pride and personal trust to do the job are the cornerstones of the management approach. They told me that the organization is made up of human beings that want to achieve and require care for each other and from management as well. It was readily apparent that these three firmly believed and practiced what they were telling me. Management expects mistakes from its employees because management will make mistakes. The point is to learn from the mistake and move on. They encourage all to do what they believe is right and to have the courage to do it. Whatever makes the worker happy, then do it. Thomas Hochman put it best when he said, “We are in our 44<sup>th</sup> year of trying to do what we do.” There is the constant drive for success, raising the bar and trying to do what they do better.

Mr. Kelly, Mr. Hockman and Ms. Cooper emphasized that they have the responsibility to tell the people they work with how to improve themselves. It is considered a disservice to not do so.

If conflict does arise, then company procedure is to follow the open door philosophy to the maximum. This means that the line-level employee can walk into the CEO’s office and air their grievance. Asked was how the involved supervisor feels when this happens.

The response was, "You can't be so thin skinned." In other words, if the supervisor was wrong, then they will learn from the situation without sanction.

There are four employee behaviors that will give rise to termination: 1. Any drug use (the company mandates a drug screen prior to hire and will perform random tests depending on the position held by the employee); 2. Use of alcohol and/or intoxicated while on duty; 3. Excessive absenteeism without justification; and 4. Fighting on company property. The company may suspend an employee and/or suspend profit sharing privileges if there is a violation of trust.

The company believes that people will produce more than what is expected if they are trusted. Another example of this trust is the absence of time clocks. Employees are not required to punch a time clock. There are no job descriptions because the company feels there is not anything you shouldn't be able to do. It is common practice for the president of the company to shovel the snow off the sidewalk in front of the building. Line level employees regularly evaluate their supervisors. It is strongly felt that that if there is a performance issue, the system is so sound that either the supervisor or the employee is not in line with the system philosophy.

Other benefits are numerous. In addition to standard vacation time, the company provides an astounding array of services. For example:

- Profit sharing including the awarding of shares for good attendance.
- On-site medical facility staffed by two doctors and appropriate support personnel, which provides general care for employee families and on-duty injury emergency response.
- On-site pharmacy.
- A barber/stylist is physically located in the factory so employees can have their haircut on duty for a nominal fee of \$3.00.

- On-site Weight Watcher Counselors for a drastically reduced fee
- Numerous company picnics and cook-outs
- Full workout facility including a full sized in-door hardwood basketball floor

It is common during the busy periods for employees to work for several weeks without a day off. The base schedule is 5-8 hour days; however, during this time employees will work 7-8 hour days. When this occurs, employees are paid time-and-a-half for the hours worked between 40 and 48 and double time for any hours beyond 48. Other incentives include a pay differential for recognition of excellent performance.

The management staff encouraged a visit with line supervisors and the worker themselves. Right down the line the message was the same. The line workers spoken with felt they were trusted. Motivation was high, and more than one said this was the best company they ever worked for. Most of the supervisors started in the factory and it is common for them to step in to fill on the line if one of their team was missing. One individual has worked 25 years without calling in sick one day. The supervisors take extra care to ensure their team members are informed as to why they are performing a certain task. Safety, quality and quantity (in that order) are preached.

Finally, the company employs over 5,000 people and has never laid off an employee in its history.

The working environment of Worthington Industries, at least in part, can be adopted to the law enforcement model. Several similarities can be drawn between the law enforcement model and this steel manufacturing organization. Both are part of a slow changing business environment and Worthington instituted a salary system for the line-level employee, which is unique when compared to similar businesses. The resulting

change in the organizational climate – commitment, loyalty, high productivity, retention and longevity, mirrors the projected effect of a salary system for the law enforcement profession.

## Chapter VI

### Conclusion

As leaders of the law enforcement profession, we must continuously explore with an open mind alternative ways of doing business. Current and future generations have listened and learned well the Golden Rule of treating others as we would like to be treated ourselves. Being compensated as a profession and treating each other as professionals will, I believe, lead to higher standards and public respect beyond what exists today.

Thinking, acting and being paid like a professional truly takes us into a realm where productivity and problem solving work hand-in-hand at peak efficacy. A synergistic environment can be created similar to what Worthington Industries has experienced. The beauty of this thought is that we would not be doing something new. The old saying of “Don’t reinvent the wheel” holds true here as Worthington has been paying their line-level factory workers a salary since 1966.

Taking not the final step into professionalism, but rather the first step into a new frontier with exciting unknowns with salary and a management shift in leadership philosophy acting as the bridge to be crossed. Whatever the worst consequence can be, at least will be paid like other professions.

## Appendices

---

**Appended 1**  
Complete List of Potential Trends/Issues  
Identified by NGT Panel

---

1. Increased Teamwork
2. Recruitment Difficulty
3. Changing Demographics
4. Impact on Shift Differential and Overtime Pay/Extra Shifts
5. Retention
6. Increased Police Department Flexibility – Broader Background
7. Valuing and Compensating Extra Work Time
8. Change National Employment Rates
9. Minimum Staffing and Who Defines Emergencies
10. Budgets more Predictable
11. OT management training
12. Lack of Motivation
13. Changes Leadership
14. Impact on Seniority
15. Support/Lack of Support from Police Officers
16. Fewer Issues at Bargaining Table
17. Concern for Inequitable Workload Distribution
18. Changes in Union Power
19. Necessity for Clear Organizational Goals and Objectives
20. Would it be Fair?
21. Lack of Dedication
22. Hiring Practices/Standards
23. Impact on Promotion
24. Public Perception
25. Simplify Payroll and Record Keeping
26. Distrust Between Office and Management
27. Change in Privatization Trends for Law Enforcement
28. Revision of Evaluation Criteria
29. Morale Would Increase
30. Lack of Loyalty
31. Political Influence
32. More Congenial Work Environment
33. Perception of Peer Working Groups
34. Raise the Bar and Requirements for New Hires
35. Concern for Back-Fillings Leave Vacancies
36. Changes in Professional Commitment
37. All Pay Reportable to PERS
38. Profit Sharing
39. Professionalism/Motivation
40. Affirmative Action

41. Impact on special assignments
42. Higher pay
43. How to Transition from Current System to Straight Salary
44. Officer's Resistance to Reduced Compensation
45. More Creative Work Incentives
46. New Approaches to Training
47. New Approaches to Discipline (Abschire)
48. Flexible Schedules
49. Cost Effectiveness
50. Tax Base Funding
51. Impact on Law Enforcement if Some Agencies Adopt
52. and Others do Not
53. Benefit Some Officers but Not Others
54. Broader Scope Duties Make for More Staff
55. Desirable to Other Agencies
56. Influence Off/On Fire/EMS Employees
57. Pay for Performance Opportunities Change
58. Distrust and Fear of Change
59. Officers See Bigger Picture
60. Recruitment Enhancement
61. Virtue has no reward
62. Impact on Filling Extra Shift
63. Impact on Filling Less Desirable Shifts
64. Quality of Offices Being Hired
65. How to Compare Straight Salary with other Pay Scales
66. Agencies Offerings, Other Bonus Pay
67. Evaluation of Staffing Needs
68. Opportunity for Individual Employment Contracts
69. Could Implement Job Sharing and Telecommuting
70. Career Motivation
71. Monetary Impact
72. Comparing Officer Salary with Management
73. Community Policing
74. Overtime Management
75. Impact on other Salaries
76. Discontent Among Officers if Pay Differentials
77. Team Problem Solving
78. Democrat US Republican Philosophy
79. Conflict Resolution Impact

**Appended 2**  
Complete List of Events  
Identified by the NGT Panel

---

1. Change National Employment Rate
2. Development of Individual Employment Contracts
3. Change in Management
4. Labor Agreements
5. Metro Consolidation
6. Change in Labor Law F.L.S.A.
7. State Revenue Grabs
8. Media Coverage of Scandal Related to Topic
9. Crime Rate Reaches All Time Low
10. Mass Employee Exodus
11. High/Low Unemployment
12. Economic-Stock Market Crash
13. Federal Government Subsidization
14. Mandatory Government Downsizing
15. Change of Police Officer Job Scope-Public Safety
16. New Police Chief
17. Contract for Police Services
18. Non-Sworn Police Chief
19. Key Union Official Appointed to Key Political
20. Position/Post
21. New Labor Decision/Law that Bars Straight Salary
22. Regional Partnership
23. Expand Civilian Force
24. Strike-Because of Topic
25. Binding Arbitration
26. Success of Another Straight Salary System
27. Decriminalization of Drugs
28. New Mayor/Council – Political Reorganization
29. Labor Union Issues
30. Increased PD Flexibility
31. Lack of Motivation
32. Fewer Issues at the Bargaining Table
33. New Approaches to Discipline (Abschire)
34. Opportunity for Individual Employment Contract
35. Community Policing

## Endnotes

---

<sup>2</sup> Dexter Mast, Six Gold Stars, (Berkeley: Glen Press, 1990)

<sup>3</sup> San Mateo County District Attorney's Office, Interview with Deputy District Attorney

<sup>4</sup> George L. Moss, Police Forces in History, (Beverly Hills, California 1975)

<sup>5</sup> Saturday Evening Post (June 1949)

<sup>6</sup> CQ Researcher 2/5/93 V3 N5 P 104

<sup>7</sup> Dr. Steven Vicchio, Command College Lecture (November 1998)

<sup>8</sup> Margaret Wheatley, Leadership and the New Science, (San Francisco: Barrett-Koehler Publishers, Inc. 1995)

<sup>9</sup> Command College Handout Strategic Planning (1998)

<sup>10</sup> Worthington Employee Handbook (1999)

---

## **Bibliography**

---

- Alameda County Library - Fremont Branch, Job Information Data Base
- California Department of Justice, Community Policing and Problem Solving, (Sacramento: DOJ 1992).
- Katzenbach, Jeffery, Teams at the Top, (Harvard Business School 1997).
- Mast, Dexter H., Six Gold Stars, (Berkeley: Glen Press, 1990).
- Mosse, George L., Police Forces in History, (Unknown)
- "Police History," The CQ Researcher, 5 February 1993, V3,N5, P 104.
- Roberg, Roy R., Police and Society, (Unknown)
- San Carlos Police Department Rules and Regulations General Order 2.29  
Domestic Violence and Protection Orders.
- San Mateo County District Attorneys Office, Conversation with Anonymous  
Deputy District Attorney
- Saturday Evening Post (June 1949)
- Thompson, George Dr., Verbal Judo, Seminar 1985
- Webster's New World Dictionary, (New York: Warner Books, Inc. 1995).
- Wheatley, Margaret, Leadership and the New Science,  
(San Francisco: Berrett-Koehler Publishers, Inc. 1992).
- Worthington, Industries 1998 Annual Report
- Worthington, Industries Employee Handbook